Iranian Distance Education Journal

ISSN: 2588-4476

Vol. 5, No. 1, (New Series) Winter-Spring 2023 (P 108-116), Payame Noor University

Original Article

Investigating teachers' experience of teaching bilingual students (a phenomenological study)

Parvaneh Valavi*1, Fereydoun Tamradi Manganani2, Seyyed Mansour Marashi3

- 1. Associate Professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz
- 2. M A student of history and philosophy of education, Department of Educational Sciences, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz.
- 3. Associate professor, Department of Educational Sciences, Faculty of Educational Sciences and Psychology, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz

Received: 2022/06/22 **Accepted:** 2022/10/22

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to know the lived experience of Ahvaz city teachers in teaching bilingual students and it was done by phenomenological method. The research community includes all primary school teachers in Ahyaz. Sampling was done in a purposeful way and all the samples were chosen voluntarily from among the teachers who dealt with bilingual students. The sample size depended on data saturation, which finally included 21 people. The data collection method is a semi-structured interview. After collecting the data, it was coded and analyzed. Analyzes have been done using thematic analysis. After analyzing the experiences of participating teachers, the findings include 6 main themes and 13 sub-themes. The main themes are: non-native language, inconsistency between the language of the teacher and the learner, learner's disability and teacher's fatigue, love to teaching, communication, local language, methods. The result of the research shows that establishing a friendly relationship with children, involving students and their parents in their children's educational affairs, using educational aids suitable for the local and environmental conditions of bilingual students are more effective in their education. Also, teachers of bilingual schools should participate in classes and workshops that provide the correct methods of interaction with bilingual students and relative familiarity with their language and culture.

Keywords

bilingualism, bilingual student, education, lived experience.

Introduction

Education is a communication process and language forms the basis of this communication. Bilingualism is one of the important topics regarding the relationship between language and education. In specialized texts, those whose mother tongue is different from their regional or national language are called bilingual and those who speak two or more languages; It is called trilingual. Basically, bilingualism or multilingualism are different forms of the same phenomenon, most of the issues raised in the field of bilingualism can be generalized to multilingual people as well (Kamali, 1999) (1).

Iran is a country with many dialects. Due to the multiplicity of Turkish, Arabic, and local dialects such as Kurdish, Lori, Balochi, etc., every year, a large number of students enter primary school with mastery of their ethnic and mother tongue and little familiarity with Persian. All children at the age of 6 or 7 do not have the same language status and their mastery of Farsi is not the same. This is despite the fact that sometimes coping with this phenomenon becomes a problem for parents and teachers.

Some children learn their own language in their family-social environment, and their entry into

^{*}Corresponding Author: p.valavi@scu.ac.ir

school is considered an accident; Because in terms of form and content, the school is different from the family and the child's previous environment. Now, if the language of the school is very different from the language of the students, the dimensions of this incident will be wider and its negative effects on the academic life of the students will be greater. The negative consequences of bilingualism appear when the mother tongue is only a means of communication in the home and society and has no place in the child's education system.

A child who has been cared for or loved by only one language in interactions with parents and others, suddenly another language is used to communicate with him, which may hurt the child's feelings. According to Vahidi, (2011) (2) the bilingual environment is often a compulsion, not a choice. Also, children who only spoke in their native language before entering school, after entering school, face many difficulties such as academic failure, dropping out, running away from school, mental frustrations, aggression, anxiety, fear, isolation and other difficulties. they face each other (Kazemi, 2007) (3).

In other words, the entrance of a bilingual child to school has negative consequences for his academic progress, social, emotional and cognitive growth. In addition, because the child is exposed to a language with which he is unfamiliar and is not found in his cultural content, a communication gap is established between the child and the school.

With these conditions and its practical process, the existence of educational disorders due to different language situations is inevitable, because language, that is, the main tool and condition of education, acts as an obstacle to education and information transfer. A large number of students during the following years, due to lack of sufficient mastery of the educational language, do not understand the lessons presented and remain behind academically. Of course, it should be emphasized that bilingualism is not always considered a threat, but if appropriate attention is paid to the mother tongue, it can lead to the strengthening of othe) (4).

The results of some research indicate the superiority of bilinguals in executive actions in general and flexibility in particular. This shows the fact that the cognitive superiority of bilinguals is due to the nature of using two different languages (Arbabi et al 2013: 1) (5).

Also, children who receive regular bilingual education from their parents can improve in language learning and reading as much as monolingual children (Larrotta et al., 2009) (6). Sharif et al. (2013) (7) investigated the feasibility of bilingual lesson planning in lementary education and showed that the attitude of the respondents towards bilingual lesson planning was positive, that is, managers and teachers participating in this research have a positive attitude towards bilingual education.

Shukurova (2009) (8) investigated bilingualism and bilingual education among parents of bilingual children in Iceland. In this research, the participants emphasized the importance of teaching the mother tongue and believed that supporting the mother tongue is an important part of the education process.

In their research, Assare et al (2013) (9) also discussed the effect of preschool education on the academic progress and social adjustment of first bilingual elementary school students. The results of the research show that first grade bilingual male students who have had preschool education have more and higher academic progress and social adjustment than girls. The difference in the average scores of the academic progress of the Persian course is more significant compared to other courses, and this is due to the relationship between language comprehension and material understanding with course comprehension and reading literacy progress, and as a result, the effect of the preschool period on language learning skills.

Considering the number of bilingual regions and the number of bilingual students in Iran, the need to study the phenomenon of bilingualism more and more deeply from different aspects is felt. In the same way, the importance and necessity of conducting the present research comes from this, that it is possible to solve many educational issues and problems in bilingual areas, only by examining and knowing deeply and qualitatively, the lived experiences of teachers who

themselves are involved in problems in this area. Another necessity of conducting this research is that if the educational problems in bilingual areas are ignored, the lack of language coordination affects the other education of the learners and makes it difficult for them to understand the content and concepts and even life skills. opportunity for students and bilingual students with linguistic support and vocabulary of two languages shine in the society and educational environment, Unfortunately, it has become a problem in our country for various reasons. Observations show that in the bilingual areas of the country, especially the Arabic-speaking areas, the phenomenon of bilingualism has caused educational problems and social anomalies; And in this regard, when there is a problem in educational progress in a region, the result is dropping out and running away from school, and finally the emergence of social anomalies. Therefore, these possible problems double the necessity of conducting practical research in order to solve the problem. Therefore, in this research, an attempt has been made to use the lived experience of elementary school teachers in Ahvaz city in relation to the education of bilingual (Arabic) students.

Research Methodology

The method of this research is qualitative and phenomenological. The purpose of phenomenology is to describe specific phenomena, objects and life experiences as they appear (Strabert and Carpenter, 1999) (10). In this study, hermeneutic phenomenology was used with emphasis on Van Manen's view and method to discover the teachers' lived experiences of teaching bilingual students. In Van Manen's phenomenological approach, the study of lived experience and reaching its root is provided through scientific description and explanation, accurate and from a specific perspective (van Manen, 1997) (11).

Society and research sample

The statistical population of this research is made up of all primary school teachers in Ahvaz city. The selection of the research sample was done in a purposeful way and based on the declaration of readiness of the teachers to participate in the research and includes teachers who were teaching in bilingual areas. The sample size was not determined from the beginning, but based on the principle of data saturation in qualitative studies after data collection, it included 21 people, including 9 female teachers and 12 male teachers. Therefore, the final sample number of the research was dependent on data saturation and the researcher continued interviewing the teachers until he felt that no new findings were obtained.

Data collection tool

In this research, semi-structured interviews were used to collect data. The reason for using semi-structured interviews is to avoid inducing the researcher's mentality to the participants and prevent the researcher from guiding the interview. Also, at the beginning of the research, the researcher explained the goals and stages of the research to the participants and obtained their consent to participate in the research. The duration of the interview varied from 46 minutes to 95 minutes.

These interviews were recorded and after conducting the interview, the text was written down on paper and their main themes and points were extracted. In order to measure the accuracy of the results of data analysis, the results of the analyzes which included the initial manuscripts prepared from the interviews and the labels obtained from their analysis were provided to the participants so that in case of contradiction of this perception with their experiences, specify the cases and express their opinion. At the end of this process, the extracted themes were classified and summarized in six main themes based on their relationship with each other.

Data analysis

Thematic analysis is a basic method in qualitative research that provides a flexible way and an accessible approach to analyzing qualitative research (Brown and Clark, 2006) (12). In this study, thematic analysis with constant comparison was the chosen model for data analysis. This

technique facilitates the formation of themes and their discovery. The steps of Brown and Clark (2006) that were used in data analysis are:

- 1. Reading and reviewing the data collected from each interview;
- 2. Examining the labeled data and determining what the labeled data has to do with the research questions:
- 3. Data coding in a systematic way;
- 4. Categorizing related data and formulating patterns;
- 5. Matching and comparing the data of each participant with the data of previous participants that have been analyzed before;
- 6. Data that conform to established patterns are identified and collated;
- 7. Combination and classification of patterns in the form of themes;
- 8. Organizing themes to match the supporting patterns and preparing a thematic map of the analyses;
- 9. Refining the features of each theme;
- 10. Write an analysis for each topic.

Research findings

After analyzing the experiences of participating teachers, the findings include 6 main themes and 13 sub-themes. The main themes are: non-native language, inconsistency between the language of the teacher and the learner, pervasive disability and teacher fatigue, love of education and teaching, communication, auxiliary use of the mother tongue. Table 1 mentions these main and sub-themes:

Table 1. Wall and secondary themes extracted from the analysis of teachers experience	
Main themes	Sub themes
1.Non-native language	Empowering non-native speakers
	Teaching and learning non-native language
2.Inconsistency between the language	Lack of mutual linguistic understanding
of the teacher and the learner	Isolation of the student
3.Pervasive disability and teacher fatigue	Limitation in the acquisition of concepts by
	the learner
	Boredom of teacher and student
4.Love to teaching	Patience and hope
	Commitment and love for education
	Trust building
5.Connections	Participation
	Communication with parents
	Getting to know and using the student's
6.Assisted use of mother tongue	mother tongue
	Playing local and indigenous games

Table 1. Main and secondary themes extracted from the analysis of teachers' experience

- 1- The first main theme: Non-native language, the first important issue in the experience of teachers in bilingual areas was teaching children in their non-native language. It means students who do not know the official language of the country and speak their mother tongue. This theme includes 2 sub-themes of empowering people with non-native language, teaching and learning non-native language.
- 1-1- Sub-theme: Empowering people with a non-native language, the analysis of the interviewees' statements indicates that not knowing a non-native language does not mean a student's disability, but one can discover universal hidden abilities and talents by teaching a second language. Interviewee 4: "If bilingual students are taught correctly and the teacher is patient in teaching them, they can raise people with higher abilities." Interviewee 15: "Empowering bilingual students will lead to better learning of concepts in the coming years." And

learning the lessons will be better."

- 2-1- Sub-theme: Teaching and learning non-native language, all the interviewees were unanimous in this issue that formal non-native language education is essential because it helps students better understand the subjects and communicate with others. Interviewee 20: "In order for students to be able to communicate with society, school, teacher, etc., we have to teach them a non-native language." Interviewees 13 and 6: "Because the non-native language is lexically and grammatically different from one's native language, it is necessary for bilingual students to receive proper education." Interviewee 7: "Education of the official language of the country is necessary for all those who live there, so it is necessary to carefully teach the official language of the country."
- 2- The main theme: Language inconsistency between the teacher and the learner, another problem of teaching bilingual children in the teachers' lived experience is that the students do not understand the teacher's words and the teacher's lack of familiarity with the student's language. This theme includes 2 sub-themes of lack of understanding and mutual understanding of language and isolation of students.
- 1-2- Sub-theme: Lack of linguistic understanding and mutual understanding, the analysis of the interviewees' statements indicates that not having a single language in the classroom causes problems for teachers and students, the most important of which is the lack of mutual understanding. Interviewee 1: "The teacher's unfamiliarity with the language of the students and vice versa often causes misunderstandings and causes problems. " Interviewee 12: "The student and the teacher have a good and effective relationship due to the lack of verbal communication with each other. They don't find it." Interviewee 8: "Because we don't speak the same language as the students, we are unable to understand their problems. That's why we can't help them in time." Interviewee 9: "Bilingual students don't understand even the simplest phrases like sit down, put that book away, etc. "
- 2-2- Sub-theme: Student isolation, the interviewees believed that the student's lack of understanding of the teacher's language causes his isolation, frustration and lack of interaction. Interviewees 11 and 16: "When students can't share their words with the teacher, they get frustrated and disappointed." Interviewees 12 and 5: "Students whose mother tongue is different from the whole class are usually withdrawn and do not communicate with other students." Interviewee 14: "The bilingual student does not cooperate with the teacher in making education easier and does not associate himself with the class." Interviewees 21 and 17: "Bilingual students have identification problems and because they are unable to coordinate with the class, they become withdrawn and do not interact with others."
- 3- The main theme: Comprehensive disability and teacher fatigue, limitation in acquiring concepts by the comprehensive and disability and fatigue caused by it, is another theme that was found in the analysis of the lived experience of teachers in bilingual regions. This theme includes 2 sub-themes of limitation in acquiring concepts by the learner and impatience of the teacher and students.
- 1-3- Sub-theme: limitation in acquiring concepts by the learner, the analysis of the statements of the interviewees indicates that the students who are not familiar with the official and non-native language cannot communicate with the concepts and content of the courses and use them. Interviewee 18: "Bilingual students do not understand the concepts due to language limitations and do not want to sit in the classroom and listen to the lesson." Interviewee 19: "The teacher of bilingual students cannot convey the educational concepts to them because they do not share the same language with them. " Interviewees 3 and 6: "Bilingual students are unable to apply the lessons in their lives because they do not understand the lessons in the classroom." Interviewee 4: "Because the vocabulary of the non-native language in Bilingual students are weak, so they face many problems in reading, writing and spelling words."
 - 2-3- Sub-theme: Impatience of teacher and student, the interviewees believed that the lack of

language communication between teachers and students causes their impatience and fatigue. Interviewee 12: "Bilingual students don't want to stay in class from the second hour of class." Interviewee 5: "The lack of comprehension and understanding of the material by bilingual students leads to fatigue and boredom of teachers." Interviewees 15 and 9 "As soon as the teacher gets the idea that despite his hard work, he cannot achieve the desired result, he feels tired and helpless."

- 4- The main theme: Love for teaching, by analyzing the lived experience of bilingual school teachers, it was found that many of them are a little disappointed at the beginning of their work and have no hope of changing the situation of learners who do not know the official language; But with the passage of time, they teach these students with love and try to find ways and methods to communicate with such students. This theme includes 2 sub-themes of patience and hope and commitment and love for education.
- 1-4- Sub-theme: Patience and hope, the analysis of interviewees' statements indicates that patience and perseverance in teaching has been one of the most important success factors in teachers' experience. Interviewees 11, 3 and 15: "In the first days of classes, the teacher is disappointed with the results of the work and has no hope for the future of the lesson. With the passage of time and assimilation of words, they improve in terms of understanding, this It gives encouragement and hope to the teacher and student." Interviewees 2 and 14: "Patience and perseverance and not getting discouraged are necessary for teaching in bilingual areas."
- 2-4- Sub-theme: Commitment and love for education, the teacher must love teaching and be committed in performing his duties. He should try to communicate and interact with students. This can lead to his success in education. Interviewee 12: "We are trying to find ways and methods in the education of bilingual students that we can use to communicate with such students." Interviewee 18: "In the first days of the beginning of the academic year, I deal with bilingual students like a mother who is just teaching her child. Of course, this requires that I love teaching and working with children."
- 5- The main theme: Communication, by analyzing the lived experience of bilingual school teachers, it was determined that they all emphasized on expanding communication and interaction with students and even their parents, and that it is one of the effective methods to interest learners in learning the official language of participation in They knew class and school activities and improving education. This theme includes 3 sub-themes of trust building, participation and communication with parents.
- 1-5- Sub-theme: Trust building, the analysis of interviewees' statements indicates that gaining their trust is one of the most effective things in the education of bilingual children. Interviewee 11: "In order to successfully interact with bilingual students, I gain their trust. This helps them to try to accompany the class and communicate with the teacher and others". Interviewee 21: "Sometimes in order to establish a relationship with them, I try to raise their confidence and encourage them to communicate more by preparing small prizes and finding excuses to encourage them." Interviewee 13: "Sometimes in order to establish a relationship with them, I say some words in their mother tongue and then I specify what we mean in Farsi."
- 2-5- Sub-theme: Participation, according to the interviewees, encouraging bilingual learners to participate in class activities and group work can be effective in their education. Interviewee 20: "Bilingual students usually do not participate in school activities because they think they will be made fun of by others." Interviewee 10: "To attract the participation of bilingual students, I usually give them responsibilities in the class." Interviewee 13: "In order to attract the participation of bilingual students, I try to make them interact and accompany others through group work."
- 3-5- Sub-theme: Communicating with parents, the analysis of the interviewees' statements indicates that one of the most effective things in the education of bilingual children is communication and interaction with their parents. Interviewee 21: "I try to communicate with

their parents in order to attract students' participation." Interviewee 17: "While communicating with the students' parents, I ask them to try to use Farsi language programs on TV and radio to strengthen their children's language." Interviewee 20: "I try to have a friendly and sincere relationship with the parents of students so that they make more efforts to educate their children with non-native and official language."

6- The main theme: Auxiliary use of the mother tongue, some interviewees believed that one of the ways to teach bilingual students is the relative familiarity of the teacher with their mother tongue. This can contribute to the success of the teacher and better education of the students. This theme includes 2 sub-themes of getting to know and using the students' mother tongue, playing local and native games.

1-6- Sub-theme: Getting to know and using the students' mother tongue, interviewees 1 and 3: "Teachers should be familiar with the students' mother tongue to some extent in order to be able to establish effective identification and initial communication." Interviewees 12 and 4: "Teachers must have a deep understanding of the culture and language of the students in order to be able to manage and guide the cultural conflict between the mother tongue and the Persian language." Interviewee 5: "It is better for teachers to use the students' native language at the beginning of education to communicate effectively." Interviewees 7 and 16: "Using linguistic symbols with the help of the mother tongue and mastering the assimilation of bilingual words can greatly help the child's language development."

2-6- Sub-theme: Playing local and native games, interviewee 2: "using local language and local games and replacing words and vocabulary of the mother tongue instead of the standard language during the game can greatly help the child's language development. "Interviewees 13 and 14: "In order to communicate with bilingual students, we play games with them and try to use the games they play in their living environment and with their languages in order to teach some words and concepts."

Conclusion and suggestions

The main question of this research was how the teachers interpreted and experienced the education of bilingual students. In order to answer this question, interviews were conducted with teachers who work with bilingual students. They believed that the meaning of bilingual education means teaching children in their non-native language and facing students who do not know the official language of the country and speak in their native language. According to the interviewees, if bilingual students receive correct education, and teachers are patient in teaching them, they can raise people with higher abilities.

In addition, empowering bilingual students makes them learn concepts better in their academic years and learn lessons better. Also, some teachers believed that while teaching bilingual students is very enjoyable, it is also very difficult. The teacher should be proficient in giving the meaning of the words and adapting that meaning to the students' mother tongue and use new methods and methods in the education of the students.

In expressing their lived experience of teaching bilingual students, the teachers have problems such as the students not understanding the teacher's words, the teachers not being familiar with the students' mother tongue, the lack of teaching aid facilities, the lack of learning the lessons, the teacher's boredom, the lack of Effective communication between teacher and student, lack of language understanding and understanding of student's feelings, lack of verbal communication, etc.

The interviewees believed that a teacher who deals with bilingual students should love teaching and training bilingual students and should be somewhat familiar with the mother tongue of bilingual students.

Also, teachers must have a deep understanding of the culture and attitude of their families so that they can handle the cultural conflict between the mother tongue and the official language well and guide it in the right direction and help them learn more effectively. Establishing a friendly relationship with children, involving students and their parents in their children's educational affairs, using educational aids appropriate to the local and environmental conditions of bilingual students can also be effective in their education. According to the belief of the interviewees, teachers of bilingual schools should participate in classes and workshops that provide the correct methods and methods of interaction with bilingual students and relative familiarity with their language and culture.

In the current research, one of the main themes was the use of the local language and the localization of the educational system. during which the use and familiarity with the students' mother tongue, as well as playing local and native games in the educational environment were extracted as sub-themes, and these findings are consistent with the results of the research of Sharif et al (2013) (7). Also, according to their educational experience, in this research, the teachers had a positive attitude towards bilingual education, as far as the readiness of human resources and facilities for the implementation of the program was declared to be medium to high.

In the results of Shukurova's research (2009) (8), the importance of teaching in the mother tongue is also reported. Also, the interviewees believed that supporting the mother tongue is an important part of the educational process. This has been emphasized by all the teachers. Another theme of this research was students' lack of understanding and lack of mutual understanding of the language. In other words, most of the teachers considered the problem of lack of mutual understanding of the language and not understanding them to be caused by the lack of harmony between the language of the students and the teachin g language of the teachers, which is in line with the results of the research of Assare et al (2013) (9).

According to the results of this research, bilingual students are more withdrawn, frustrated and disappointed than other students. This is in accordance with the results of Assare et al (2013) (9) and Kazemi (2007) (3). Also, Larruta et al. (2009) (6) believe that children who are regularly taught bilingually by their parents can progress as well as monolingual children in learning language and reading, which is in line with the results of this research.

Suggestions are provided for the education of bilingual students:

- The teaching of local languages is stipulated in the constitution. It is suggested that the educational system of the country should consider measures to realize it in bilingual areas. These measures can be aimed at preparing educational books in the language of each region, employing teachers fluent in the language of each region, and using educational programs in the local language in each region.
- One of the main themes of teachers' lived experience was to use appropriate educational methods and techniques to solve educational problems in bilingual areas, including the use of facilities and strategies available in these areas. Accordingly, the teachers of these regions are advised to use different learning-teaching methods, educational aids such as audio-visual and drama that are appropriate to the language and culture of those regions.
- Using local games and replacing words and vocabulary of the mother tongue instead of the standard language during the game can also be effective in teaching students in bilingual areas.

Ethical considerations

In conducting and implementing the current research, the principles of professional ethics related to the study have been observed.

Acknowledgements

I sincerely thank all the teachers and parents who helped us to do the research as best as possible.

References

- [1] Kamali, Behnaz (1999). The results of bilingual education in the second grade students of primary schools in Tehran, Zanjan, Islamic Azad University Publications.
- [2] Vahedi, Shahram (2011). Bilingual educational approaches and strategies and its cognitive, emotional and social consequences. Proceedings of Bilingualism and Education Conference: Challenges, Prospects and Solutions. Tehran, Social Studies Research Institute Publications.
- [3] Kazemi, Mohammadreza. (2007), investigating the effect of a one-month bilingual preparation program on language learning and Persian lessons of elementary school students in the bilingual areas of Ahvaz and Ramhormoz cities. Thesis (master's degree), Allameh Tabatabai University.
- [4] Maroufi, Yahya; Mohammadinia, Ismail (2013). Bilingualism and its relationship with critical thinking skills. Educational Innovations: Spring 2012, Volume 12, Number 45, pp. 45-60.
- [5] Arbabi, Sarah; Sharifi, Shahla; Mashhadhi, Ali (2013). The effect of bilingualism on cognition: a case study of Azeri-Persian bilinguals. Journal of Linguistic Research in Foreign Languages (Foreign Language Research), Spring and Summer 2013, Volume 3, Number 1, pp: 1-18.
- [6] Larrotta, Claren& Y sabel Ramirez (2009). Literacy benefits for Latena/o Parents engaged in a spanish literacy Project. Journal of adolescent & adult literacy vol. 52, Iss.7;pg. 621.10ppgs.
- [7] Sharif, Mustafa; Nowrozi, Reza Ali; Mousavizadeh, Mir Mohammad (2012). Feasibility of bilingual lesson planning in primary education, a case study of East and West Azerbaijan provinces. Curriculum Research Quarterly, Term 2, Number 2.
- [8] Shukurova, maria (2009). bilingualism and bilingual education in iceland, sigillum universitals islandiae. Available in: http://language.ws/icelandic/bilingualism-bilingual-education-iceland-study-importance-
- [9] Assare et al (2013). The effect of preschool education on the academic achievement and social adjustment of first bilingual elementary school students. Teaching and learning research. Volume 20, Number 3, Autumn and Winter 2013. Pages: 303 to 312.
- [10] Streubert, H. J., & Carpenter, D. R. (1999). Qualitative research in nursing: advancing the humanistic imperative (2nd ed.) Philadelphia: Lippincott
- [11] Van manen, m. (1997). Researching lived experience: human science for an action sensitive pedagogy (2nd ed). London, ontario, canada: althouse press.
- [12] Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3(2), 77-101.



COPYRIGHTS

© 2023 by the authors. Lisensee PNU, Tehran, Iran. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY4.0) (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0)